

Not So Fresh ML

Nicolas Pouillard and François Pottier

`{Nicolas.Pouillard,Francois.Pottier}@inria.fr`

CANS Seminar, 2009

Towards safer and more expressive languages for meta-programming

**Program representation
should stay well-typed and
well-scoped**

Pursuing the work on FRESHML

- Inspired from FRESHML
- pure FRESHML for its safety
- Caml for its expressiveness

A taste of FreshML/C α ml

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term
  = Var Atom
  | App Term Term
  | Lam < Atom × neutral Ty × inner Term >
  | Let < Atom × outer Term × inner Term >
```

Capture avoiding substitution

$\text{subst} :: (\text{Atom}, \text{Term}) \rightarrow \text{Term} \rightarrow \text{Term}$

$\text{subst } (a, v) = \text{go}$

where

$\text{go } (\text{Var } b) = \text{if } a \equiv b \text{ then } v \text{ else } \text{Var } b$

$\text{go } (\text{App } t \ u) = \text{App } (\text{go } t) (\text{go } u)$

$\text{go } (\text{Lam}\langle b, ty, t \rangle) = \text{Lam}\langle b, ty, \text{go } t \rangle$

$\text{go } (\text{Let}\langle b, t, u \rangle) = \text{Let}\langle b, \text{go } t, \text{go } u \rangle$

Computing the size of a term

```
size :: Term → Int
size (Var _)      = 1
size (App t u)    = 1 + size t + size u
size (Lam<_,_,t>) = 3 + size t
size (Let<_,t,u>) = 3 + size t + size u
```


FreshML considered !

FreshML considered too fresh!

More efficient programs

Freshening is useless while:

- Computing the size of a term

More efficient programs

Freshening is useless while:

- Computing the size of a term
- Computing free variables

More efficient programs

Freshening is useless while:

- Computing the size of a term
- Computing free variables
- Typing some languages

More efficient programs

Freshening is useless while:

- Computing the size of a term
- Computing free variables
- Typing some languages
- Counting occurrences of some variable

More efficient programs

Freshening is useless while:

- Computing the size of a term
- Computing free variables
- Typing some languages
- Counting occurrences of some variable
- Substituting closed terms for variables

More efficient programs

Freshening is useless while:

- Computing the size of a term
- Computing free variables
- Typing some languages
- Counting occurrences of some variable
- Substituting closed terms for variables
- Deciding α -equivalence

More efficient programs

Freshening is useless while:

- Computing the size of a term
- Computing free variables
- Typing some languages
- Counting occurrences of some variable
- Substituting closed terms for variables
- Deciding α -equivalence
- ...

To freshen or not to freshen?

- While FRESHML implicitly freshen

To freshen or not to freshen?

- While FRESHML implicitly freshen
- This system allows both non-freshening and freshening openings

To freshen or not to freshen?

- While FRESHML implicitly freshen
- This system allows both non-freshening and freshening openings
- However we will only the non-freshening part

World-index types for atoms

World-index types for atoms

let $x = x$ in x

Let's classify atoms by a world they live in

The type of atoms is now indexed by a world

type Atom α

Let's classify atoms by a world they live in

The type of atoms is now indexed by a world

type Atom α

Equality is homogeneous and prevents mixing worlds

$(\equiv)_{\text{Atom}} :: \forall \alpha. \text{Atom } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Atom } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Bool}$

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term
  = Var Atom
  | App Term Term
  | Lam < Atom × neutral Ty × inner Term >
  | Let < Atom × outer Term × inner Term >
```

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term outer
  = Var (Atom outer)
  | App (Term outer) (Term outer)
  |  $\exists$ inner. Lam (Atom inner) Ty (Term inner)
  |  $\exists$ inner. Let (Atom inner) (Term outer) (Term inner)
```

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Lam (Atom  $\beta$ ) Ty (Term  $\beta$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Let (Atom  $\beta$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\beta$ )
```

Worlds are closely related to each other

The type of (oriented) links between worlds

type $\beta \triangleright \alpha$

Worlds are closely related to each other

The type of (oriented) links between worlds

type $\beta \triangleright \alpha$

Links holds the set of atoms as a frontier

$\alpha \stackrel{(\neq S)}{\triangleright} \beta$

Worlds are closely related to each other

The type of (oriented) links between worlds

type $\beta \triangleright \alpha$

Links holds the set of atoms as a frontier

$\alpha \stackrel{(\neq S)}{\triangleright} \beta$

Links are supposed to be invisible/inferred!

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Lam (Atom  $\beta$ ) Ty (Term  $\beta$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Let (Atom  $\beta$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\beta$ )
```

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Lam ( $\beta \triangleright \alpha$ ) (Atom  $\beta$ ) Ty (Term  $\beta$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Let ( $\beta \triangleright \alpha$ ) (Atom  $\beta$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\beta$ )
```


Link operations

Identity link

$\text{id}_{\text{Link}} :: \forall \alpha. \alpha \triangleright \alpha$

Link operations

Identity link

$\text{id}_{\text{Link}} :: \forall \alpha. \alpha \triangleright \alpha$

Link composition

$(\circ)_{\text{Link}} :: \forall \alpha \beta \gamma. (\beta \triangleright \gamma) \rightarrow (\alpha \triangleright \beta) \rightarrow (\alpha \triangleright \gamma)$

Link operations

Identity link

$\text{id}_{\text{Link}} :: \forall \alpha. \alpha \triangleright \alpha$

Link composition

$(\circ)_{\text{Link}} :: \forall \alpha \beta \gamma. (\beta \triangleright \gamma) \rightarrow (\alpha \triangleright \beta) \rightarrow (\alpha \triangleright \gamma)$

Atomic link

$\text{atomic}_{\text{Link}} :: \forall \alpha. \text{Atom } \alpha \rightarrow (\alpha \triangleright \alpha)$

Casts to walk through links

Atomic casts

$\text{cast}_{\text{Atom}} :: \forall \alpha \beta. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow (\text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow \text{Atom } \alpha)$

Casts to walk through links

Atomic casts

$$\text{cast}_{\text{Atom}} :: \forall \alpha \beta. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow (\text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow \text{Atom } \alpha)$$

Generalized casts

$$\text{cast}_f :: \forall \alpha \beta f. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow (f \beta \rightarrow f \alpha)$$

Casts to walk through links

Atomic casts

$$\text{cast}_{\text{Atom}} :: \forall \alpha \beta. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow (\text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow \text{Atom } \alpha)$$

Generalized casts

$$\text{cast}_f :: \forall \alpha \beta f. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow (f \beta \rightarrow f \alpha)$$

Cast implies proof obligations or dynamic checks!

Atom abstraction as existential quantification

Hiding the real world but keeping a link

$\text{data } \alpha \langle f \rangle = \exists \beta. \text{Abs } (\beta \triangleright \alpha) (\text{Atom } \beta) (f \beta)$

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Lam ( $\beta \triangleright \alpha$ ) (Atom  $\beta$ ) Ty (Term  $\beta$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Let ( $\beta \triangleright \alpha$ ) (Atom  $\beta$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\beta$ )
```

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  | Lam  $\alpha < \lambda \beta \rightarrow$  (Ty, Term  $\beta$ )>
  | Let  $\alpha < \lambda \beta \rightarrow$  (Term  $\alpha$ , Term  $\beta$ )>
```

Making an abstraction

$\text{Abs} :: \forall \alpha \beta f. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow f \beta \rightarrow \alpha \langle f \rangle$

Making an abstraction

Abs $:: \forall \alpha \beta f. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow f \beta \rightarrow \alpha \langle f \rangle$

Lam $:: \forall \alpha \beta. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow \text{Term } \beta \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha$

Making an abstraction

$\text{Abs} :: \forall \alpha \beta f. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow f \beta \rightarrow \alpha \langle f \rangle$

$\text{Lam} :: \forall \alpha \beta. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow \text{Term } \beta \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha$

$\text{mkLam} :: \forall \alpha. \text{Atom } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha$
 $\text{mkLam } x \ t = \text{Lam } (\text{atomic } x) \ x \ t$

Making an abstraction

Abs $:: \forall \alpha \beta f. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow f \beta \rightarrow \alpha \langle f \rangle$

Lam $:: \forall \alpha \beta. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow \text{Term } \beta \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha$

mkLam $:: \forall \alpha. \text{Atom } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha$
mkLam x t = Lam (atomic x) x t

mkConst x y = mkLam x (mkLam y (Var x))

Opening an abstraction does not freshen it

```
let (Abs Ink x y) = t in u
```

Opening an abstraction does not freshen it

let (Abs Ink x y) = t in u

$\Gamma \vdash t : \alpha \langle f \rangle$ where $\alpha \in \Gamma$

Opening an abstraction does not freshen it

let (Abs lnk x y) = t in u

$\Gamma \vdash t : \alpha \langle f \rangle$ where $\alpha \in \Gamma$

$\Gamma, \beta, \text{lnk} : \beta \triangleright \alpha, x : \text{Atom } \beta, y : f \beta \vdash u : \tau$ where $\beta \# \tau$

Safety Properties

- Well-typed programs do not get stuck

Safety Properties

- Well-typed programs do not get stuck
- α -equivalence is preserved by casts

Safety Properties

- Well-typed programs do not get stuck
- α -equivalence is preserved by casts
- Casts may dynamically fail or be proven successful

Safety Properties

- Well-typed programs do not get stuck
- α -equivalence is preserved by casts
- Casts may dynamically fail or be proven successful
- α -equivalence is defined structurally on types

Example commuting abstraction with pairs

$\text{commute} :: \forall \alpha. \alpha < \lambda \beta \rightarrow (\text{Term } \beta, \text{Term } \beta) >$
 $\rightarrow (\alpha < \text{Term} >, \alpha < \text{Term} >)$

$\text{commute } t =$

let $(\text{Abs } \text{Ink } x (y,z)) = t$
in $(\text{Abs } \text{Ink } x y, \text{Abs } \text{Ink } x z)$

Name capture does not type-check

wrong $:: \forall \alpha. \alpha \langle \text{Term} \rangle \rightarrow \text{Term} \alpha \rightarrow \alpha \langle \text{Term} \rangle$

wrong $t \ u =$

 let (Abs lnk x y) = t

 in Abs lnk x u

Computing the size of a term

$\text{size} :: \forall \alpha. \text{Term } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Int}$

$\text{size } (\text{Var } _) = 1$

$\text{size } (\text{App } t \ u) = 1 + \text{size } t + \text{size } u$

$\text{size } (\text{Lam } _ _ _ t) = 3 + \text{size } t$

$\text{size } (\text{Let } _ _ t \ u) = 3 + \text{size } t + \text{size } u$

Computing the size of a term

$\text{size} :: \forall \alpha. \text{Term } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Int}$

$\text{size } (\text{Var } _) = 1$

$\text{size } (\text{App } t \ u) = 1 + \text{size } t + \text{size } u$

$\text{size } (\text{Lam } _ _ _ t) = 3 + \text{size } t$

$\text{size } (\text{Let } _ _ t \ u) = 3 + \text{size } t + \text{size } u$

Polymorphic recursion!

Computing free variables

$\text{remove} :: \text{Atom} \rightarrow [\text{Atom}] \rightarrow [\text{Atom}]$

$\text{remove } [] = []$

$\text{remove } a (b:bs)$

| $a \equiv b = \text{remove } a \text{ } bs$

| otherwise = $b : \text{remove } a \text{ } bs$

$\text{fv} :: \text{Term} \rightarrow [\text{Atom}]$

$\text{fv } (\text{Var } a) = [a]$

$\text{fv } (\text{App } t \ u) = \text{fv } t \ ++ \ \text{fv } u$

$\text{fv } (\text{Lam } \langle a, _, t \rangle) = \text{remove } a \ (\text{fv } t)$

$\text{fv } (\text{Let } \langle a, t, u \rangle) = \text{fv } t \ ++ \ \text{remove } a \ (\text{fv } u)$

Computing free variables

remove ::

$$\forall \beta \alpha. (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow [\text{Atom } \beta] \rightarrow [\text{Atom } \alpha]$$

remove - [] = []

remove lnk a (b:bs)

| a \equiv b = remove lnk a bs

| otherwise = cast lnk b : remove lnk a bs

fv :: $\forall \alpha. \text{Term } \alpha \rightarrow [\text{Atom } \alpha]$

fv (Var a) = [a]

fv (App t u) = fv t ++ fv u

fv (Lam lnk a _ t) = remove lnk a (fv t)

fv (Let lnk a t u) = fv t ++ remove lnk a (fv u)

Looking up an environment

```
data Env  $\beta$  = Empty
           |  $\exists \alpha$ . Snoc ( $\beta \triangleright \alpha$ ) (Env  $\alpha$ ) (Atom  $\beta$ ) Ty
```

```
lookupEnv ::  $\forall \alpha$ . Atom  $\alpha \rightarrow$  Env  $\alpha \rightarrow$  Ty
lookupEnv a (Snoc lnk env b ty)
  | a  $\equiv$  b      = ty
  | otherwise    = lookupEnv (cast lnk a) env
lookupEnv _ Empty = error "unbound value"
```

Typing a term

```
typing ::  $\forall \alpha$ . Env  $\alpha$   $\rightarrow$  Term  $\alpha$   $\rightarrow$  Ty
typing env (Var v)
  = lookupEnv v env
typing env (Lam lnk a ty t)
  = ty 'TyArrow' typing (Snoc lnk env a ty) t
typing env (Let lnk a t u)
  = typing (Snoc lnk env a (typing env t)) u
typing env (App t u)
  = case typing env t of
    from 'TyArrow' to | from  $\equiv$  typing env u  $\rightarrow$  to
    _  $\rightarrow$  error "ill typed"
```

Challenges and future work

- Deeper formalization and proofs

Challenges and future work

- Deeper formalization and proofs
- α -equivalence for inside-out abstractions

Challenges and future work

- Deeper formalization and proofs
- α -equivalence for inside-out abstractions
- Better understanding of heterogeneous comparison

Challenges and future work

- Deeper formalization and proofs
- α -equivalence for inside-out abstractions
- Better understanding of heterogeneous comparison
- Integrating complex binding structures

Challenges and future work

- Deeper formalization and proofs
- α -equivalence for inside-out abstractions
- Better understanding of heterogeneous comparison
- Integrating complex binding structures
- Properties implied by world polymorphism

Conclusion

- Explicit scopes using world indices

Conclusion

- Explicit scopes using world indices
- Non-freshening opening

Conclusion

- Explicit scopes using world indices
- Non-freshening opening
- Atom abstraction as existential quantification

Conclusion

- Explicit scopes using world indices
- Non-freshening opening
- Atom abstraction as existential quantification
- Expressiveness close to a manual model with names

Questions?

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term
  = Var Atom
  | App Term Term
  | Lam < Atom × neutral Ty × inner Term >
  | Let < Atom × outer Term × inner Term >
```


Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term outer
  = Var (Atom outer)
  | App (Term outer) (Term outer)
  |  $\exists$ inner. Lam (Atom inner) Ty (Term inner)
  |  $\exists$ inner. Let (Atom inner) (Term outer) (Term inner)
```

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Lam (Atom  $\beta$ ) Ty (Term  $\beta$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Let (Atom  $\beta$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\beta$ )
```

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Lam ( $\beta \triangleright \alpha$ ) (Atom  $\beta$ ) Ty (Term  $\beta$ )
  |  $\exists \beta$ . Let ( $\beta \triangleright \alpha$ ) (Atom  $\beta$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\beta$ )
```

Data type for explicitly typed lambda calculus

```
data Term  $\alpha$ 
  = Var (Atom  $\alpha$ )
  | App (Term  $\alpha$ ) (Term  $\alpha$ )
  | Lam  $\alpha < \lambda \beta \rightarrow$  (Ty, Term  $\beta$ )>
  | Let  $\alpha < \lambda \beta \rightarrow$  (Term  $\alpha$ , Term  $\beta$ )>
```

Polymorphic values represent closed terms

A more direct presentation of atom sorts

Generalizing C_{α} ml data structures

Picking fresh atoms

fresh x in t

Picking fresh atoms

fresh x in t

- The atom can be used in the world you like

Picking fresh atoms

fresh x in t where $x \# (t \Downarrow)$

- The atom can be used in the world you like
- Same proof obligation as in pure FRESHML

Picking fresh atoms (second version)

```
fresh x,lnkExp,lnkImp in t
```

Picking fresh atoms (second version)

fresh $x, \text{InkExp}, \text{InkImp}$ in t

$\Gamma, \beta, \text{InkExp}: \beta \triangleright \alpha, \text{InkImp}: \alpha \triangleright \beta, x: \text{Atom} \quad \beta \vdash t : \tau$
where $\alpha \in \Gamma, \beta \# \tau$

Picking fresh atoms (second version)

fresh $x, \text{InkExp}, \text{InkImp}$ in t

$\Gamma, \beta, \text{InkExp}: \beta \triangleright \alpha, \text{InkImp}: \alpha \triangleright \beta, x: \text{Atom} \quad \beta \vdash t : \tau$
where $\alpha \in \Gamma, \beta \# \tau$

- The fresh atom is in an existential world

Picking fresh atoms (second version)

fresh $x, \text{lnkExp}, \text{lnkImp}$ in t

$\Gamma, \beta, \text{lnkExp}: \beta \triangleright \alpha, \text{lnkImp}: \alpha \triangleright \beta, x: \text{Atom} \quad \beta \vdash t : \tau$
where $\alpha \in \Gamma, \beta \# \tau$

- The fresh atom is in an existential world
- Links are provided to import and export things

Picking fresh atoms (second version)

fresh $x, \text{lnkExp}, \text{lnkImp}$ in t

$\Gamma, \beta, \text{lnkExp}:\beta \triangleright \alpha, \text{lnkImp}:\alpha \triangleright \beta, x:\text{Atom} \quad \beta \vdash t : \tau$
where $\alpha \in \Gamma, \beta \# \tau$

- The fresh atom is in an existential world
- Links are provided to import and export things
- Proof obligations relied to casts

Freshening is still available

let (Abs _lnk (fresh x) y) = t in u

Freshening is still available

let (Abs $_lnk$ (fresh x) y) = t in u

Freshening allows to use the same world

$\Gamma \vdash t : \alpha \langle f \rangle$ where $\alpha \in \Gamma$

$\Gamma, _lnk : \alpha \triangleright \alpha, x : \text{Atom } \alpha, y : f \ \alpha \vdash u : \tau$

Precise control over scopes

Having explicit world subsume:

- *Cam*l inner/outer/neutral annotations

Precise control over scopes

Having explicit world subsume:

- *Cam*l inner/outer/neutral annotations
- *Cam*l pattern types/expression types distinction

Precise control over scopes

Having explicit world subsume:

- $\text{C}\alpha\text{ml}$ inner/outer/neutral annotations
- $\text{C}\alpha\text{ml}$ pattern types/expression types distinction
- FRESHML/ $\text{C}\alpha\text{ml}$ atom sorts

Safe heterogeneous comparison!

Safe heterogeneous comparison!

$\text{atmEqH} :: \forall \alpha \beta. \text{Atom } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Bool}$

Safe heterogeneous comparison!

$$\text{atmEqH} :: \forall \alpha \beta. \text{Atom } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Atom } \beta \rightarrow (\beta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Bool}$$
$$\begin{array}{l} \text{atmEqH } a \ b \ \text{Ink} \mid b \notin \text{Ink} = a \equiv \text{cast } \text{Ink } b \\ \mid \text{otherwise} = \text{False} \end{array}$$

Substituting closed terms for variables

substClosed ::

$$\forall \alpha. \text{Atm } \alpha \rightarrow (\forall \beta. \text{Term } \beta) \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha \rightarrow \text{Term } \alpha$$

substClosed a v = go id

where

$$\text{go} :: \forall \delta. (\delta \triangleright \alpha) \rightarrow \text{Term } \delta \rightarrow \text{Term } \delta$$
$$\begin{aligned} \text{go Ink (Var b)} & \mid \text{atmEqH a b Ink} = v \\ & \mid \text{otherwise} = \text{Var b} \end{aligned}$$
$$\begin{aligned} \text{go Ink (App t u)} \\ & = \text{App (go Ink t) (go Ink u)} \end{aligned}$$
$$\begin{aligned} \text{go Ink (Lam Ink' b ty t)} \\ & = \text{Lam Ink' b ty (go (Ink \circ Ink') t)} \end{aligned}$$
$$\begin{aligned} \text{go Ink (Let Ink' b t u)} \\ & = \text{Let Ink' b (go Ink t) (go (Ink \circ Ink') u)} \end{aligned}$$